

**BID EVALUATION REPORT FOR**  
**CIVIL WORKS (NCB)**

Implementation of Bus Rapid Transit System (BRTS) in Hubli-Dharwad  
Project

Loan Number: 7818 IN

**National Competitive Bidding for**  
**Package – 2: Construction of Terminal Building at Mitra Samaj in Dharwad**  
**under Hubli-Dharwad BRTS Project**

1. Scope of contract and approximate cost:

**Brief description of works:** The Contract Package PW-2 covers the work of **Construction of Terminal Building at Mitra Samaj in Dharwad under Hubli-Dharwad BRTS Project**

**Estimated cost:** The total estimated cost put to tender for PW-2 is Rs 1096.34 lakhs. The estimate was based on the PWD Schedule of rates for the year 2015-16 (Dharwad Circle) and market rates. Estimates were prepared by the design Consultants M/s CEPT Ahmadabad.

2. Bidding document:

- **Approval by World Bank/Govt:**

As the said work is under Post review, no need of approval from WB

- **Variations from the approved document, if any:** - NA -

- **Specifications and drawings (approval):** Technical scrutiny was done by Chief Engineer KUIDFC NKUSIP, Regional office IT Park Hubli.

- **Implementation schedule and stipulated time for completion:** Milestones have been fixed as indicated below:

MILESTONES	Activities to be completed
Milestone-1 (A*+4 months)	Completion of all works ( Civil/Electromechanical/plumbing/others as per BOQ related to Basement /finishing ) related Basement area of terminal as per the instructions of Engineer In charge
Milestone-2 (A+9 months)	Completion of all works ( Civil/Electromechanical/plumbing/others as per BOQ related to Basement /finishing ) related Ground floor of terminal as per the instructions of Engineer In charge.
Milestone-2 (A+12 months)	Completion of all works ( Civil/Electromechanical/plumbing/others as per BOQ related to Basement /finishing ) related First floor of terminal & terrace as per the instructions of Engineer In charge

- **Important bidding conditions, such as, price adjustment, if any, etc:**

Price adjustment Clause is not applicable.

3. Bid invitation process:

- **Bid invitation advertisement in national press, names of news papers and dates of publication**

Bids were invited vide notification No. HDBRTS/tenders/PW-2/2016-17/230 dated 16-05-2016. Notification was published in following newspapers. Copy of invitation to bids is enclosed as annexure 1.

Sl. No.	Name of Newspaper	Date of Publication
1	The Times of India ( All India Edition)	17.05.2016
2	The Hindu ( All India Edition)	17.05.2016
3	Vijay Karnataka ( All Karnataka Edition)	17.05.2016
4	Prajavani ( All Karnataka Edition)	17.05.2016
5	Vijayavani ( All Karnataka Edition )	17.05.2016
6	India Trade Journal	25.05.2016

- Bid documents were available to download through e-procurement portal, Government of Karnataka from 17.05.2016 onwards.
- **Number of bidders who purchased the bidding documents and their nationality:**  
3 Bidder had participated in the bidding process through e-procurement portal. Out of which one Bidder namely M/s Vishal Nirmitti Pvt Ltd has furnished the Bank Gurantee for EMD & paid the EMD in E-procurement portal and has not submitted the bid.
- **Prebid conference, minutes of meeting and resulting amendments, if any:**
  - Pre-bid meeting was scheduled on 07.06.2016 but two bidders participated in the pre-bidding meeting. However, clarifications sought through email were clarified.
  - Corrigendum-1 was issued on 23-06-2016 regarding changes in calendar of events.

<b>Last date and time for receipt of tenders</b>	<b>15.07.2016 upto 17.30 Hrs IST</b>
<b>Date and time for opening of Technical bid</b>	<b>18.07.2016 at 11.00 Hrs IST</b>

- **Date and time of public bid opening, attendance, highlights of the bid opening meeting, etc:**  
Bids were opened on e-procurement portal at 11 AM on 18.07.2016

#### 4. Bid response:

2 Bidder had participated in the bidding process and two were Indian Nationals.

(i) **In time: 2**

(ii) **Late : 0**

-----  
**Total : 2**

#### Technical bids:

To facilitate preliminary examination of the bids, the documents pertaining to eligibility criteria (other than the financial quotes) were opened in the first instance on 18.07.2016 List of the bidders who had submitted the bids online through e-portal is as indicated below. None of the representatives of the bidders were present during opening of the technical bids.

Sl. No.	Name of bidder	Nationality	Remarks
1	M/s Suprada construction Company	Indian	
2	M/s Suresh Enterprises Pvt Ltd Company	Indian	

5. **Clarifications obtained, if any:** Clarification was sought from M/s Suresh Enterprises Pvt Ltd Company Suprada to produce the work done certificates along with proof of TDS Certificates regarding Truss work, Stainless steel railing works and Electrical works executed by the collaborator.

6. **Preliminary examination of bids:** An Internal committee of HDBRTS was met on 15-09-2016 to evaluate the responsiveness of the bids before placing the same before Technical Evaluation committee on 16.09.2016. Further the committee opined that, the technical bid of M/s Suresh Enterprises Pvt Ltd, Hubballi is not fulfilling the technical qualification criteria as stipulated in the bid document. As though the clarifications were sought in writing and M/s Suresh Enterprises Pvt Ltd failed to provide necessary clarifications. Hence the technical bid of M/s Suresh Enterprises Pvt Ltd found to be non responsive and hence rejected. Hence the technical bid of M/s Suprada Construction Company is accepted and found to be responsive.

Proceedings of evaluation committee meeting held on 16.09.2016 is enclosed as annexure-2.

- List of the bids rejected as non-responsive. – One

Sl. No.	Name of bidder	Bid price	Brief reasons for rejection
1.	M/s Suresh Enterprises Pvt Ltd	--	<p>As per the bidding documents, HDBRTSCo has written to M/s Suresh Enterprises Pvt Ltd on 01.08.2016 for clarification on the work done certificates of the collaborator agency. The agency has not submitted the clarification. Further HDBRTSCo has written to M/s Suresh on 18.08.2016 to submit the clarification within 3 days.</p> <p>The M/s Suresh Enterprises Pvt Ltd has submitted in writing vide their letter dated 22.08.2016 with work done certificates issued by M/s Suresh Enterprises Pvt Ltd in favor of Kalmesh Industries for structural steel ( issued on 29.04.2015) and for stainless steel ( issued on 05.05.2016) along with income tax TDS certificates without any proper proof of execution of structural and steel works. Even though the work done certificates are issued by M/s Suresh Enterprises Pvt Ltd on 29.04.2015 &amp; 05.05.2016 much before the submission of bid , but same were not submitted along with bid.</p> <p>The technical bid of M/s Suresh Enterprises Pvt Ltd, Hubballi is not fulfilling the technical qualification criteria as stipulated in the bid document . Hence the technical bid of M/s Suresh Enterprises Pvt Ltd found to be non responsive and hence rejected.</p>

7. Evaluation of substantially responsive bidders: Evaluation Report is enclosed as Annexure-3 Financial quotes were opened on 17-10-2016 as stated below.

Rank	Bidder	Bid Price
1.	M/s Suprada Construction Company	12,87,95,677.98 (L1)

The evaluation of the financial bid has been carried out as per the provisions of the bidding documents. The justifications for the rates offered by the bidder were obtained for major governing items and for the items quoted below the estimate. The justifications and rate analysis submitted by bidder were forwarded to PMC, LASA for comments and opinion. Based on the comments of the PMC, clarifications were sought by the Bidder again. A internal meeting was held under the chairmanship of Managing Director to discuss on the financial

bids/justifications/clarifications obtained (proceedings of the meeting is enclosed herewith) and the unbalanced rates are identified as the "rates which are less than the estimated rates".

8. Pre-qualification/Verification for prequalified bidders: Please see the Annexure-4

9. Recommendations:

The bidder M/s Suprada Construction Company vide his letter dated 29.11.2016 has submitted rebate of **Rs. 28,02,310.00** by reducing rate of some items in his offer . Hence the recommendations for award Contract to the technically responsive lowest bidder M/s **M/s Suprada Construction Company, for a contact value of Rs. 12,59,63,368.00 (L1)**

- Advances – **Rs 62,98,169.00**(Rupees Sixty Four Lakh Thirty Nine thousand Seven Hundred Eighty Four only) (5% of the bid amount)
- Price adjustment is not covered under the contract and is applicable till completion of the stipulated period and extension if any granted.
- Performance security to be furnished in the form of Bank Guarantee for 5% of the Contract value works out to be **62,98,169.00-** say Rs.63,00,000.00
- Additional security proposed for unbalanced rates is worked out and is **Rs : 49,10,000/-**
- Bid validity is 120 days from the date of submission of the bid. I.e. bid is valid till 13-01-2017
- Stipulated period of completion is 12 months from the date of handing over of site to the contractor.
- The contractor has to execute the work as per the mile stones indicated in the bidding document; failing which liquidated damages will be levied.

10. Value of contract proposed for approval:

SI No.	Currency	Amount	Amount in Equivalent Rupees
01	INR	Rs. 12,59,63,368.00	Rs. 12,59,63,368.00

  
 Managing Director  
 Hubli-Dharwad BRTS Co Ltd

Enclosures

1. Copy of Invitation for bids. (Annexure 1)
2. Technical Bid Opening Proceedings (Annexure -2)
3. Proceedings of the meeting of Technical Evaluation Committee held on 16-09-2016. (Annexure 3)
4. Bid Evaluation Report. (Annexure 4)
5. Proceedings of opening of Financial Bids held on 17-10-2016 (Annexure 5)
6. Assessment of Bids. (Annexure 6)
7. Comparative statement of offers. (Annexure 7)
8. Details of Recommended bidder. (Annexure8)

**Annexure VI/1****Assessment of Bids**

Sl. No.	Particulars	Bidder 1 .....	Bidder 2 .....	Bidder 3 .....
1.	Name of Bidder	M/s Suprada Construction Company	-	-
2.	Country of Origin	India	-	-
3.	Bid Price	<b>Rs. 12,59,63,368.00</b>	-	-
4.	Credentials ..... Letter of Authorization	Yes	-	-
5.	Commercial Assessment*	Satisfactory	-	-
6.	Technical Assessment*	Satisfactory	-	-
7.	Decision on Responsiveness	Responsive to the bidding document	-	-
8.	Capacity cum Capability* Assessment (Post/ Prequalification)	Satisfactory	-	-

**Annexure VI/2****EVALUATION OF THE BIDS**

Analysis for Responsiveness of Bid:

<b>Sl. No.</b>	<b>Particulars and Clause Reference</b>			<b>M/s Suprada Construction Company</b>		
1.	Validity of Bid	ITB	15	120 days from the date of submission i.e. up to 13.01.2016		
2.	Bid Security	ITB	16			
	5.1 Form of Bid Security			Rs.1,00,000/- through e-payment and balance in the form of BG		
	5.2 Bank and Branch			Syndicate Bank Dharwad.		
	5.3 Expiry Date			13-01-2017		
	5.4 Amount			Rs 21,00,000/-		
3.	Letter of Authorization	ITB	18.2	Yes		
4.	Bid Form	ITB	12.1	Submitted		
5.	Decision on Commercial Responsiveness			Responsive		

**Annexure VII****Comparative Statement of Offers:** Enclosed as Annexure-7

**Annexure VIII****Details of Recommended Offer**

1. Total Value of Bid in Rupees : **Rs. 12,59,63,368.00**
2. Advances: Mobilization / Equipment : **Rs. 62,98,169.00**
3. Interest on Advance, if any : **-NA-**
4. Performance Security : **Rs. 62,98,169.00**
5. Additional Performance Security for Unbalanced rates, if any : **Rs. 49,10,000/-**
6. Retention Money : **6% of the each bill and up to 5% of contact amount.**
7. Milestones to be achieved:

<b>MILESTONES</b>	<b>Construction of Terminal Building at Mitra Samaj in Dharwad</b>
Milestone-1 (A*+4 months)	Completion of all works ( Civil/Electromechanical/plumbing/others as per BOQ related to Basement /finishing ) related Basement area of terminal as per the instructions of Engineer In charge
Milestone-2 (A*+9 months)	Completion of all works ( Civil/Electromechanical/plumbing/others as per BOQ related to Basement /finishing ) related Ground floor of terminal as per the instructions of Engineer In charge
Milestone-3 (A*+12 months)	Completion of all works ( Civil/Electromechanical/plumbing/others as per BOQ related to Basement /finishing ) related First floor of terminal & terrace as per the instructions of Engineer In charge

8. Liquidated Damages for different milestones :

The liquidated damages for the whole of the works are Rs.54,800 per day and that for the milestone are as under :

<b>MILESTONES</b>	<b>Construction of Terminal Building at Mitra Samaj in Dharwad</b>
Milestone-1 (A*+4 months)	Rs 21,900 /-
Milestone-2 (A*+9 months)	Rs 19,200/-
Milestone-3 (A*+12 months)	Rs 13,700/-

  
**Managing Director**  
**Hubli-Dharwad BRTS Co Ltd**

# Hubli-Dharwad BRTS Co Ltd

1st Floor, KSFC Building, Rayapura Dharwad

\*\*\*\*\*

## Proceedings of the Managing Director, Hubli-Dharwad BRTS Co Ltd dated 29.11.2016

Package – 2 (Construction of Terminal Building at Mitra samaj in Dharwad ) Implementation of Bus Rapid Transit System (BRTS) in Hubli-Dharwad Project

Ref:

1. Proceedings of the Technical evaluation committee held on 16-09-2016.
2. Proceedings of the opening of financial bids dated 17-10-2016.
3. This office E-mail dated regarding justification of rates from the bidder 18.10.2016 & 07-11-2016.
4. PMC, LASA, comments on Bidder correspondences as above by e-mail dated 07-11-2016
5. This office e-mail regarding clarifications to PMC comments to bidder dated 10-11-2016.
6. Suprada Construction Letter No: 069 Dtd 29.11.2016.

The Financial Bid have been opened (Unlocked) by tender inviting authority at 12.00PM PM on 17-10-2016 at office of the HDBRTS Co Ltd, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, KSFC Building Rayapura, Dharwad (Karnataka) in the presence of the officials of the HDBRTS Co Ltd and is as below.

Rank	Bidder	Bid Price	above
1.	M/s Suprada Construction Company	12,87,95,677.98 (L1)	17.42 %

The justification was sought by the bidder vide ref (3) .The breakups of rates obtained by the bidders were forwarded to Project Management Consultant (M/s Lea Associates India Pvt Ltd) of HD BRTS Project. The Team Leader vide His email under ref (4) has submitted the comments and opinion. Based on the comments of the PMC, clarifications were once again sought to the Bidder vide email dated 10.11.2016.The bidder M/s Suprada Construction Company vide his letter dated 29.11.2016 has submitted rebate of **Rs. 28,02,310.00** by reducing rate of some items in his offer .

Thus the financial evaluation was carried out and is a s below.

Rank	Bidder	Bid Price	above
1.	M/s Suprada Construction Compnay	Rs. 12,59,63,368.00	14.87 %

Following were discussed,

- Implementation of environment management plan ., etc
- Context of enhancement in the schedule of rates of PWD, Dharwad circle for the year 2016-17.
- Price adjustment clause is not applicable to the package and rates are also inclusive of Excise Duty.
- The retendering process will take again substantial time and will affect the project timelines.
- Unbalanced rates are identified as the "rates which are less than the estimated rates" and additional performance security in the form of Bank Guarantee to be submitted by the bidder for Rs.49,10,000.00 .

The offered price of M/s Suprada Construction Company Rs. **Rs. 12,59,63,368.00** which is **14.87 % above the estimate** is recommended for award and LOA will be issued to the bidder.

*W-08 29/11/2016*  
Managing Director  
*B*