

BID EVALUATION REPORT FOR
CIVIL WORKS (NCB)

Implementation of Bus Rapid Transit System (BRTS) in Hubli-Dharwad Project
Loan Number : 7818 IN

National Competitive Bidding for

Package – 9 Constructions of Bus Terminal at Old City Bus Station at Dharwad under e-Procurement System

1. Scope of contract and approximate cost:

- **Brief description of works** : The Contract Package PW-9 covers the work of Construction of Bus Terminal at Old City Bus Station at Dharwad. The bus station currently caters for operation of city and mofussil services. The proposed terminal facility includes construction of bus shelters, building consisting of passenger amenities, ticket counters etc, building for driver's facilities, subway, etc. The terminal functions as an interchange facility for commuters of city buses and mofussil buses.
- **Estimated cost**: The total estimated cost put to tender for PW-9 is Rs **13,17,19,765.88 /-** . The estimate was based on the PWD Schedule of rates for the year 2012-13 (Dharwad Circle). The lowest bid that was received was **14,87,18,894.23 /-** **12.91 % above** the amount put to tender. The PWD schedule of rates has been revised with effect from 12/7/2013 for the current year (2013-14) for Dharwad Circle. Further, Superintending Engineer, PWD, Dharwad has issued amendment for considering 2% additional area weight age. Thus total area weightage to be considered for Dharwad is 8%.

The revised estimated cost of the package would be Rs **15,21,91,575.36** based on revised PWD Schedule of Rates. The lowest bid would be 2.28 % below the current SR 2013-14, when compared to the revised estimated cost of the package. Therefore, the cost of the proposed contract is Rs **14,87,18,894.23 /-**.

2. Bidding document:

- **Approval by World Bank/Govt:**
WB has cleared the tender documents vide communication dated Sept 5th 2013.
- **Variations from the approved document, if any:** - NA -
- **Specifications and drawings (approval):** Bids and BOQ is reviewed by Team Leader Project Management Consultant (LASA) and Assistant Executive Engineer

& Assistant Manger – Infrastructure of HDBRTSCO. Based on the review, Technical scrutiny was done by DGM (Infrastructure) HDBRTSCO, Rayapur, Dharwad

- **Implementation schedule and stipulated time for completion:**

Milestones have been fixed as indicated below:

MILESTONES	Terminal at Old City Bus Station
Milestone-1 (A*+4 months)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Completion of all building Works (excluding internal furnishings/ fixtures/ finishing).
Milestone-2 (A*+8 months)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Completion of internal furnishing/ fixtures/ finishing and truss work.
Milestone-3 (A*+12 months)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Completion of external works and rest of the activities for completion of scope of work and handing over of the completed terminal.

- **Important bidding conditions, such as, price adjustment, if any, etc:**

Provision of Price adjustment is not applicable as the completion period is only 12 months.

3. Bid invitation process:

- **Bid invitation advertisement in national press, names of news papers and dates of publication**

Bids were invited vide notification No.HDBRTS/tenders/PW-9/2013-14 dated 18-09-2013. Notification was published in following newspapers. Copy of invitation to bids is enclosed as annexure 1.

Sl. No.	Name of Newspaper	Date of Publication
1.	Times of India (All India Edition)	19-09-2013.
2.	The New Indian Express (All India Edition)	19-09-2013.
3.	The Hindu (All India Edition)	19-09-2013.
4.	Vijay Karnataka (All Karnataka Edition)	19-09-2013.
5.	Prajavani (All Karnataka Edition)	19-09-2013.
6.	Vijayavani (All Karnataka Edition)	19-09-2013
7.	India Tender Bulletin	25-09-2013.

- Bid documents were available to download through e-procurement portal, Government of Karnataka from 21.09.2013 onwards.

- **Number of bidders who purchased the bidding documents and their nationality:**

5 Bidders had participated in the bidding process through e-procurement portal.

- **Prebid conference, minutes of meeting and resulting amendments, if any:**

- Pre-bid meeting was held on 10.10.2013. Proceedings of the pre-bid meeting was approved by World Bank vide communication dated 18th Nov 2013.
- Corrigendum -1 was published on 30.10.2013 regarding last date of submission of tenders as below:

Last date and time for receipt of tenders	05.12.2013 upto 15:00 Hrs IST
Date and time for opening of Technical bid	07.12.2013 at 16:00 Hrs IST

- Corrigendum -2 was published on 03.12.2013 regarding last date of submission of tenders as below:

Last date and time for receipt of tenders	09.12.2013 upto 15:00 Hrs IST
Date and time for opening of Technical bid	11.12.2013 at 16:00 Hrs IST

- Addendum issued is as mentioned in table below:

Reference	As per Bid Document	Corrected as
Sec 23.1 of ITB	The Employer will open all / unlock all bids uploaded through e-procurement portal, in the presence of the Bidders or their representatives who choose to attend at --- hrs IST on --/--/----. The Bidders representatives who are present shall produce authorization letter and shall sign a register evidencing their attendance.	The Employer will open all / unlock all technical bids(The Bid excluding the Priced Bill of Quantities) uploaded through e-procurement portal, in the presence of the Bidders or their representatives who choose to attend at 16.00 hrs IST on 07/12/2013. The Bidders representatives who are present shall produce authorization letter and shall sign a register evidencing their attendance.
Sec 23.2 of ITB	The Bidders names, the sufficiency or otherwise of the bid security, the bid prices, discounts and alternative offers and such other details as the Employer, at its discretion, may consider appropriate will be announced at the opening. No bids shall be rejected at the bid opening	The Bidders names, the sufficiency or otherwise of the bid security and such other details as the Employer, at its discretion, may consider appropriate, will be announced at the opening of the technical bids. No bids shall be rejected at the bid opening. The price bid (Priced Bill of Quantities) will remain locked in e-procurement until the time of bid opening of the price bid. After the evaluation of the technical bid the Employer will invite bidders who have submitted substantially responsive technical bid and meet the required qualification criteria to attend the opening of their price bids. The Bidders names, the bid prices, discounts and alternative offers and such other details as the Employer, at its discretion, may consider appropriate, will be announced at the opening of the price bids.
Sec 23.3 of ITB	The Employer will prepare a record of the Bid opening that shall include, as a	The Employer will prepare a record of the opening of technical Bids that shall include,

	<p>minimum: the name of the Bidder; the Bid Price per lot if applicable, including any discounts, and the presence or absence of a Bid Security. The Bidders' representatives who are present shall be requested to sign the attendance sheet. A copy of the record shall be distributed to all Bidders who submitted bids in time, and posted online.</p>	<p>as a minimum the name of the Bidder; presence or absence of a Bid Security.</p> <p>Record of the opening of price bids shall be prepared by the employer that shall include as the minimum: the name of the Bidder and the Bid price including any discounts. The Bidders' representatives who are present at the bid opening shall be requested to sign the attendance sheet. A copy of the record shall be distributed to all Bidders who submitted bids in time, and posted online.</p>																																							
BOQ Item No. 108 to 113	<p>Providing two bulb undreamed pile foundation up to maximum 5 mtr. Depth including hire charges of machineries angling the pile holes, labor charges and laying 20 mm and down grade size RCC M20 keeping the reinforcement ege cutting curing etc complete. Excluding cost of steel and fabrication charges. with lead and lift loading and unloading, labor, hire charges of machinery etc complete. including bentonite slurry if require.</p>	<p>Providing two bulb undreamed pile foundation up to maximum 5mtr depth including hire charges of machineries angling the pile holes, pile cap including pile chipping, labor charges and laying 20 mm and down grade size RCC M20 keeping the reinforcement ege cutting curing etc complete. Excluding cost of steel and fabrication charges. with lead and lift loading and unloading, labor, hire charges of machinery etc complete. including bentonite slurry if require and inclusive of vertical load test</p>																																							
Sec 4.5 B of ITB	<p>Each bidder should further demonstrate:</p> <p>(a) availability (either owned or leased or by procurement against mobilization advances) 1of the following key and critical equipment for this work:</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Sl. No.</th> <th>Details of Equipment</th> <th>Minimum Number Required</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1</td> <td>Excavators</td> <td>2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2</td> <td>Concrete Mixer with weigh batcher</td> <td>2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3</td> <td>Vibrators & Needles</td> <td>4</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4</td> <td>Total Station of 2" accuracy & auto level</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>5</td> <td>Drum mix plant of 250 TPH</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>6</td> <td>Self-loader of 3.5m³ capacity</td> <td>1</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Sl. No.	Details of Equipment	Minimum Number Required	1	Excavators	2	2	Concrete Mixer with weigh batcher	2	3	Vibrators & Needles	4	4	Total Station of 2" accuracy & auto level	1	5	Drum mix plant of 250 TPH	1	6	Self-loader of 3.5m ³ capacity	1	<p>Each bidder should further demonstrate:</p> <p>(a) availability (either owned or leased or by procurement against mobilization advances) 1of the following key and critical equipment for this work:</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Sl. No.</th> <th>Details of Equipment</th> <th>Minimum Number Required</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1</td> <td>Excavators</td> <td>2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2</td> <td>Concrete Mixer with weigh batcher</td> <td>2</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3</td> <td>Vibrators & Needles</td> <td>4</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4</td> <td>Total Station of 2" accuracy & auto level</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>5</td> <td>Self-loader of 3.5m³ capacity</td> <td>1</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Sl. No.	Details of Equipment	Minimum Number Required	1	Excavators	2	2	Concrete Mixer with weigh batcher	2	3	Vibrators & Needles	4	4	Total Station of 2" accuracy & auto level	1	5	Self-loader of 3.5m ³ capacity	1
Sl. No.	Details of Equipment	Minimum Number Required																																							
1	Excavators	2																																							
2	Concrete Mixer with weigh batcher	2																																							
3	Vibrators & Needles	4																																							
4	Total Station of 2" accuracy & auto level	1																																							
5	Drum mix plant of 250 TPH	1																																							
6	Self-loader of 3.5m ³ capacity	1																																							
Sl. No.	Details of Equipment	Minimum Number Required																																							
1	Excavators	2																																							
2	Concrete Mixer with weigh batcher	2																																							
3	Vibrators & Needles	4																																							
4	Total Station of 2" accuracy & auto level	1																																							
5	Self-loader of 3.5m ³ capacity	1																																							

Clause No. 4.16 of Civil specification	Concrete mix	Minimum Cement Content per cum of concrete	Concrete mix	Minimum Cement Content per cum of concrete
	M-25	410 Kg	M-25	340 Kg

- **Date and time of public bid opening, attendance, highlights of the bid opening meeting, etc:**

Bids were opened on e-procurement portal at 16.00 hrs on 11th Dec 2013.

4. Bid response:

5 Bidders had participated in the bidding process. All the bidders were Indian Nationals.

(i) In time : 5

(ii) Late : 0

Total : 5

Technical bids:

Proceedings of Bid opening along with attendance are enclosed in annexure -2.

To facilitate preliminary examination of the bids, the documents pertaining to eligibility criteria (other than the financial quotes) were opened in the first instance on 11 Dec 2013.

Representatives of sl no 1 to 5 except sl no 3 in the table below were present. After assessment of eligibility criteria, the financial quotes of bidders termed substantially responsive were opened on 18 January , 2014. Representatives of bidders at sl no 1 to 5 except sl no 1 & 3 in the table below were present.

Sl. No.	Name of bidder	Nationality	Bid price as read out	Remarks
1.	M/s Shree Krishna shelters Pvt Ltd	Indian	NA	Nil
2.	M/s. Abhiram Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd., Bengaluru	Indian	NA	Nil
3.	M/s. KMV Projects Ltd	Indian	NA	Nil
4.	M/s. Suprada Construction	Indian	NA	Nil
5.	M/s. SHREEHARI Associates (P) Ltd., Aurangabad	Indian	NA	Nil

5. **Clarifications obtained, if any:** Nil

6. **Preliminary examination of bids:** An evaluation committee was set up to evaluate the responsiveness of the bids. Proceedings of evaluation committee meeting held on 10-01-2014 is enclosed as annexure-3.

- List of the bids rejected as non-responsive.

Sl. No.	Name of bidder	Bid price	Brief reasons for rejection
1.	Shrikirshna Shelters Pvt Ltd, Bangalore	-NA-	Bidder has not met the qualification criteria as per Bid clause 4.5 (b). Hence the bid of Shrikirshna Shelters Pvt Ltd was considered as non responsive and rejected.

7. Evaluation of substantially responsive bidders: Evaluation Report is enclosed as annexure-4. Financial quotes were opened on 18th January 2014 as stated above.

Rank	Bidder	Bid Price
2	M/s. Abhiram Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd., Bangalore	Rs. 161360537.05 (L4)
3	M/s. KMV Projects Pvt Ltd, Hyderabad	Rs. 153034360.95 (L2)
4.	M/s Suprada Constructions Ltd, Dharwad	Rs. 160479396.50 (L3)
5	M/s. SHREEHARI Associates (P) Ltd., Aurangabad	Rs. 148718894.23 (L1)

The evaluation of the financial quotes has been carried out as per the provisions of the bidding documents and the unbalanced rates are identified as the "rates which are less than 75% of the revised estimated rates".

8. Pre-qualification/Verification for prequalified bidders: Please see the annexure-4
9. Recommendations:

Recommendations for award Contract to the technically responsive lowest bidder M/s **Shreehari Associates Pvt Ltd for a contact value of Rs. 14,87,18,894.23 (L1)**

- Advances – **Rs. 74,35,944** (Rupees Seventy Four lakh Thirty Five Thousand and Nine hundred and Forty four only) (5% of the bid amount)
- Price adjustment is not covered under the contract and is not applicable till completion of the stipulated period and extension if any granted.
- Performance security to be furnished in the form of Bank Guarantee for 5% of the Contract value works out to be **Rs. 74,35,945 .00 say Rs. 74,36,000 .00**
- Additional security proposed for unbalanced rates is worked out and is **Rs. 16360565.75 say 1,63,61,000.00**
- Bid validity is 120 days from the date of submission of the bid. I.e. bid is valid till 08.04.2014
- Stipulated period of completion is 12 months from the date of handing over of site to the contractor.
- The contractor has to execute the work as per the mile stones indicated in the bidding document; failing which liquidated damages will be levied.

10. Value of contract proposed for approval:

SI No.	Currency	Amount	Amount in Equivalent Rupees
1.	INR	14,87,18,894.23	Rs 14,87,18,894.23 (L1) (Shreehari Associates Pvt Ltd)

Managing Director
Hubli-Dharwad BRTS Company Ltd

Enclosures

1. Copy of Invitation for bids. (Annexure 1)
2. Proceedings of the Technical Bid opening held on 11-12-2013. (Annexure 2)
3. Proceedings of the meeting of Technical Evaluation Committee held on 10-01-2014. (Annexure 3)
4. Bid Evaluation Report. (Annexure 4)
5. Proceedings of opening of Financial Bids held on 18th January 2014. (Annexure 5)
6. Proceedings of the Managing Director with respect to financial bids. (Annexure 6)
7. Comparative statement of offers. (Annexure 7)
8. Details of Recommended bidder. (Annexure 8)