

BID EVALUATION REPORT FOR
CIVIL WORKS (NCB)

Implementation of Bus Rapid Transit System (BRTS) in Hubli-Dharwad Project
Loan Number : 7818 IN

National Competitive Bidding for

Package – 8 Constructions of BRT Depots in Hubli & Dharwad and Divisional Workshop in Hubli under e-Procurement System

1. Scope of contract and approximate cost:

- **Brief description of works** : The Contract Package PW-8 covers the work of Construction of 2 BRT Depots – one each at Hubli and Dharwad and one Divisional Workshop at Hubli.
- **Estimated cost**: The total estimated cost put to tender for PW-8 is Rs 41,95,86,721.00/- . The estimate was based on the PWD Schedule of rates for the year 2012-13 (Dharwad Circle). The lowest bid that was received was 56,45,65,996.35/-, 34.55 % above the amount put to tender. The PWD schedule of rates has been revised with effect from 12/7/2013 for the current year (2013-14) for Dharwad Circle.

The revised estimated cost of the package would be Rs 49,61,90,476.50/- based on revised PWD Schedule of Rates. When considered with reference to the revised cost, the lowest bid would be + 13.78 %.

Therefore, the cost of the proposed contract is Rs 56,45,65,996.35/-

2. Bidding document:

- **Approval by World Bank/Govt:**
WB has cleared the tender documents vide communication dated May 8th 2013.
- **Variations from the approved document, if any:** - NA -
- **Specifications and drawings (approval):** Technical scrutiny was done by Chief Engineer (C&B), PWD (N), Dharwad.
- **Implementation schedule and stipulated time for completion:**
Milestones have been fixed as indicated below:

MILESTONES	BRT DEPOTS AT HUBLI AND DHARWAD	DIVISIONAL WORKSHOP - HUBLI
Milestone-1 (A*+4 months)	• Completion of all building Works in both the depots (excluding internal furnishings/ fixtures/ finishing's).	• Completion of all building Works (excluding internal furnishings/ fixtures/ finishing's)

Milestone-2 (A+8 months)	• Completion of internal furnishings/ fixtures/ finishing's.	• Completion of all truss works and roof works of the Workshop area.
Milestone-3 (A+12 months)	• Completion of external works and rest of the activities for completion of scope of work and handing over of the completed depots.	• Completion of internal furnishings/ fixtures/ finishing's.
Milestone-4 (A+15 months)	---	• Completion of external works and rest of the activities for completion of scope of work and handing over of the completed Workshop.

- **Important bidding conditions, such as, price adjustment, if any, etc:**

Provision of Price adjustment is made as indicated in "Clause 47: Condition of contract" of the bid document.

3. Bid invitation process:

- **Bid invitation advertisement in national press, names of news papers and dates of publication**

Bids were invited vide notification No.HDBRTS/tenders/PW-8/2013-14 dated 10-05-2013. Notification was published in following newspapers. Copy of invitation to bids is enclosed as annexure 1.

Sl. No.	Name of Newspaper	Date of Publication
1.	Times of India (All India Edition)	11.05.2013
2.	The New Indian Express (All India Edition)	11.05.2013
3.	The Hindu (All India Edition)	11.05.2013
4.	Vijay Karnataka (All Karnataka Edition)	11.05.2013
5.	Prajavani (All Karnataka Edition)	11.05.2013
6.	India Tender Bulletin	22.05-2013

- Bid documents were available to download through e-procurement portal, Government of Karnataka from 17.05.2013 onwards.

- **Number of bidders who purchased the bidding documents and their nationality:**

4 Bidders had participated in the bidding process through e-procurement portal.

- **Prebid conference, minutes of meeting and resulting amendments, if any:**

- Pre-bid meeting was held on 06-06-2013. Proceedings of the pre-bid meeting was approved by World Bank vide communication dated 27th June 2013.
- Corrigendum was issued on 11-07-2013 regarding last date of submission of tenders as below:

Last date and time for receipt of tenders	22-07-2013 upto 15:00 Hrs IST
Date and time for opening of Technical bid	25-07-2013 at 11:00 Hrs IST

- Addendum issued is as mentioned in table below:

Clause No.	As per Bid Document	Corrected as
16.1: Bid security	security in the form of bank guarantee (obtained from Nationalized/ Scheduled Bank located in India in the form given in Section 8), certified cheque or Demand Draft of amount as shown in table of IFB, drawn in the favour of Managing Director, Hubli-Dharwad BRTS Company Ltd. Bidder has to attach scanned copy of Bank Guarantee/Certified Cheque/Demand Draft to the e-procurement portal (https://eproc.karnataka.gov.in), along with the bid and has to submit original Bank guarantee/Demand Draft/Certified Cheque during the two days between the deadline for bid submission and prior to the day of opening of Technical Bids in separate cover. The bidder should also make payments towards the tender processing fees. The tender processing fees are in addition to the bid security and have to be paid as indicated in the e-procurement portal.	The bids must be accompanied by a bid security of Rs.1,00,000 (Rupees One Lakh) in the form of E-payment as specified in the e-procurement portal and Rs.59,00,000 (Rupees fifty nine lakh) in the form of bank guarantee (obtained from Nationalized/ Scheduled Bank located in India in the form given in Section 8), certified cheque or Demand Draft drawn in the favor of Managing Director, Hubli-Dharwad BRTS Company Ltd. Bidder has to attach scanned copy of Bank Guarantee/Certified Cheque/Demand Draft in the actions slot, upload bid document (additional technical documents) in the e-procurement portal (https://eproc.karnataka.gov.in), along with the bid and has to submit original Bank guarantee/Demand Draft/ Certified Cheque during the two days between the deadline for bid submission and prior to the day of opening of Technical Bids in separate cover. The bidder should also make payments towards the tender processing fees. The tender processing fees are in addition to the bid security and have to be paid as indicated in the e-procurement portal.
23.1: Bid Opening	The Employer will open all / unlock all bids uploaded through e-procurement portal, in the presence of the Bidders or their representatives who choose to attend at ----- hrs IST on --/--/----. The Bidders representatives who are present shall produce authorization letter and shall sign a register	The Employer will open all / unlock all technical bids uploaded through e-procurement portal, in the presence of the Bidders or their representatives who choose to attend at 16.00 hrs IST on 25/07/2013. The Bidders representatives who are present

	evidencing their attendance.	shall produce authorization letter and shall sign a register evidencing their Attendance.
23.2	The Bidders names, the sufficiency or otherwise of the bid security, the bid prices, discounts and alternative offers and such other details as the Employer, at its discretion, may consider appropriate will be announced at the opening. No bids shall be rejected at the bid opening	The Bidders names, the sufficiency or otherwise of the bid security, will be announced at the opening. No bids shall be rejected at the bid opening. The price bid will remain locked in e-procurement until the time of bid opening of the price bid. At the end of the evaluation of the technical bid the Employer will invite bidders who have submitted substantially responsive technical bid and met the required qualifying criteria to attend the bid opening of the price bid.
23.3	The Employer will prepare a record of the Bid opening that shall include, as a minimum: the name of the Bidder; the Bid Price per lot if applicable, including any discounts, and the presence or absence of a Bid Security. The Bidders' representatives who are present shall be requested to sign the attendance sheet. A copy of the record shall be distributed to all Bidders who submitted bids in time, and posted online.	The Employer will prepare a record of the technical Bid and price bid opening that shall include, as a minimum the name of the Bidder; presence or absence of a Bid Security. the Bid Price The Bidders' representatives who are present shall be requested to sign the attendance sheet. A copy of the record shall be distributed to all Bidders who submitted bids in time, and posted online.

- **Date and time of public bid opening, attendance, highlights of the bid opening meeting, etc:**

Bids were opened on e-procurement portal at 11 AM on 25 th July, 2013.

4. Bid response:

4 Bidders had participated in the bidding process. All the bidders were Indian Nationals.

(i) In time : 4
(ii) Late : 0

Total : 4

Technical bids:

Proceedings of Bid opening along with attendance are enclosed in annexure -2.

To facilitate preliminary examination of the bids, the documents pertaining to eligibility criteria (other than the financial quotes) were opened in the first instance on 25 July 2013. Representatives of sl no 2 and sl no 3 in the table below were present. After assessment of eligibility criteria, the financial quotes of bidders termed substantially responsive were opened on 21 August, 2013. Representatives of bidders at sl no 1 and sl no 3 in the table below were present.

Sl. No.	Name of bidder	Nationality	Bid price as read out	Remarks
1.	M/s. Abhiram Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd., Bengaluru	Indian	NA	
2.	M/s. MEIL-PRASAD (JV), Hyderabad	Indian	NA	
3.	M/s. SHREEHARI Associates (P) Ltd., Aurangabad	Indian	NA	
4.	M/s. Aditya Buildcon, Kolhapura	Indian	NA	The bidder: M/s. Aditya Buildcon, Kolhapura has not paid the tender processing fee and EMD. Hence his proposal was rejected.

5. **Clarifications obtained, if any:** Clarification was sought from M/s MEIL-Prasad (JV) regarding the work experience indicated by the bidder. The bidder did not respond to the clarifications sought.
6. **Preliminary examination of bids:** An evaluation committee was set up to evaluate the responsiveness of the bids. Proceedings of evaluation committee meeting held on 16-08-2013 is enclosed as annexure-3

- List the bids rejected as non-responsive.

Sl. No.	Name of bidder	Bid price	Brief reasons for rejection
1.	MEIL-Prasad JV (M/s Megha Engineering & Infrastructures Ltd in JV with M/s Prasad & Company)	-----	The lead partner has not executed the similar nature of work as per the requirement of Bidding documents. Ref: clause 4.3 (c) of instruction to bidders

7. **Evaluation of substantially responsive bidders:** Evaluation Report is enclosed as annexure-4. Financial quotes were opened on 21st August 2013 as stated above.

Rank	Bidder	Bid Price
1.	M/s. SHREEHARI Associates (P) Ltd., Aurangabad	Rs.56,45,65,996.35 (L-1)
2.	M/s. Abhiram Infra Projects Pvt. Ltd., Bengaluru	Rs. 58,70,47,095.43 (L-2)

The evaluation of the financial quotes has been carried out as per the provisions of the bidding documents and the unbalanced rates are identified as the "rates which are less than 75% of the estimated rates".

8. Pre-qualification/Verification for prequalified bidders: Please see the annexure-4

9. Recommendations:

Recommendations for award Contract to the technically responsive lowest bidder M/s **Shreehari Associates Pvt Ltd for a contact value of Rs.56,45,65,996.35 (L-1) :**

- Advances – **Rs.2, 82, 28, 299 .00** (Rupees Two Crore eighty two lakh and two hundred and ninety nine only) (5% of the bid amount)
- Price adjustment is covered under the contract and is applicable till completion of the stipulated period and extension if any granted.
- Performance security to be furnished in the form of Bank Guarantee for 5% of the Contract value works out to be **Rs. 2, 82, 28,299 .00 say 2, 82, 29,000 .00**
- Additional security proposed for unbalanced rates is worked out and is **Rs.19,12,717.00 say 19,13,000.00**
- Bid validity is 120 days from the date of submission of the bid. I.e. bid is valid till 24.11.2013
- Stipulated period of completion is 15 months from the date of handing over of site to the contractor.
- The contractor has to execute the work as per the mile stones indicated in the bidding document; failing which liquidated damages will be levied.

10. Value of contract proposed for approval:

Sl No.	Currency	Amount	Amount in Equivalent Rupees
1.	INR	56,45,65,996.35	Rs.56,45,65,996.35 (L-1) (Shreehari Associates Pvt Ltd)




Managing Director
Hubli-Dharwad BRTS Co Ltd

Enclosures

1. Copy of Invitation for bids. (Annexure 1)
2. Proceedings of the Technical Bid opening held on 25-07-2013. (Annexure 2)
3. Proceedings of the meeting of Technical Evaluation Committee held on 16-08-2013. (Annexure 3)
4. Bid Evaluation Report. (Annexure 4)
5. Proceedings of opening of Financial Bids held on 21st August 2013. (Annexure 5)
6. Assessment of Bids. (Annexure 6)
7. Comparative statement of offers. (Annexure 7)
8. Details of Recommended bidder. (Annexure 8)